BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY COUNCIL STATE OF WYOMING

FILED

In the Matter of:)	•	ACT 17 2000
Basin Electric Power Cooperative)	Docket No. 07-2801	OCT 17 2008
Dry Fork Station,)		Jim Ruby, Executive Secretary
Air Permit CT – 4631	')	•	Environmental Quality Council
Dry Fork Station,)		Jim Ruby, Executive Secrete Environmental Quality Coun

PROPOSED ORDER DENYING PROTESTANTS' MOTION TO STRIKE AFFIDAVIT OF KENNETH J. SNELL AS TO PM2.5 AND MERCURY

The Environmental Quality Council, (EQC) having read Protestants' Motion to Strike the Affidavit of Kenneth J. Snell and Basin Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.'s (Basin Electric) Response, and having listened to oral argument at hearing, and being fully advised in the premises, FINDS and ORDERS as follows:

Protestants ask the Council to strike the affidavit of Kenneth J. Snell in its entirety. The affidavit was filed by Basin Electric as an exhibit to their Response to Protestants' Motion for Summary Judgment. Protestants allege in their motion that the affidavit contains previously undisclosed expert opinions. At hearing, Protestants clarified their objections and specified paragraphs 6, 7, 9, and 10 as being the alleged previously undisclosed opinion testimony. Further, Protestants assert that the late disclosure of these opinions is in violation of the Council's Scheduling Conference Order and their admittance would be unduly prejudicial.

Basin Electric disputes these allegations and contends that the opinions were previously disclosed, were available for examination, and that the affidavit consists largely of fact evidence. Basin Electric argues that because the opinions and facts in the affidavit were not previously undisclosed, there can be no prejudice. Further, Basin

notes that the Protestants declined an opportunity to depose Mr. Snell about his PM2.5 opinions.

The Council finds that the opinions in the affidavit do not constitute a violation of the Scheduling Conference Order. The affidavit is largely fact evidence. The opinions at issue all pertain to PM2.5. Protestants had an opportunity to depose Mr. Snell on those opinions but did not.

THEREFORE, for the above stated reasons, IT IS ORDERED that Protestants'

Motion to Strike Affidavit of Kenneth J. Snell as to PM2.5 and Mercury is DENIED.

ORDERED this _____ day of October, 2008.

F. David Searle, Presiding Officer Environmental Quality Council 122 W. 25th St., Room 1714 Herschler Building Cheyenne, WY 82002 (307) 777-7170 ORDER DENYING PROTESTANTS' MOTION TO STRIKE AFFIDAVIT OF KENNETH J. SNELL AS TO PM2.5 AND MERCURY APPROVED AS TO FORM:

Patrick R. Day

Mark R. Ruppert

HOLLAND & HART, LLP

2515 Warren Avenue, Suite 450

P. O. Box 1347

Cheyenne, WY 82003

pday@hollandhart.com

mruppert@hollandhart.com

ATTORNEYS FOR BASIN ELECTRIC POWER

COOPERATIVE

James S. Angell

Robin Cooley

Andrea Zaccardi

Earthjustice

1400 Glenarm Place, #300

Denver, CO 80202

rcooley@earthjustice.org

azaccardi@earthjustice.org

jangell@earthjustice.org

Reed Zars

Attorney at Law

910 Kearney Street

Laramie, WY 82070

rzars@lariat.org

ATTORNEYS FOR PROTESTANTS

Jay A. Jerde

Deputy Attorney General

Nancy E. Vehr

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Luke J. Esch

Assistant Attorney General

123 Capitol Building

Cheyenne, WY 82002

NVEHR@state.wy.us

jjerde@state.wy.us

ATTORNEYS FOR DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

3935273_1.DOC