FILED

DEC 0 8 2008

Jim Ruby, Executive Secretary Environmental Quality Council

BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY COUNCIL OF THE STATE OF WYOMING

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPEAL OF CLABAUGH RANCH, INC. FROM WYPDES PERMIT NO. WY0048917

Docket No. 07-3801

FINAL ORDER FOR MODIFICATIONS OF WYPDES PERMIT NO. WY0048917 AND DISMISSAL OF PETITION FOR REVIEW

)

This matter was brought before the Wyoming Department of Environmental Quality Council ("EQC") on Clabaugh Ranch Inc.'s ("Clabaugh") Petition for Review of the Wyoming Department of Environmental Quality ("DEQ"), Water Quality Division's issuance on May 9, 2007 of a Renewal of WYPDES Permit No. WY0048917 authorizing Pennaco Energy Inc. ("Pennaco") to discharge water produced from its coal bed methane operations into tributaries of Twenty Mile Creek above the Clabaugh ranch. Clabaugh, Pennaco, and the DEQ are the only parties in this contested case.

Chapter I, Section 11(a) of the DEQ Rules of Practice and Procedure provides for disposition of contested cases by stipulation of the parties upon approval of the Council. Wyoming Statute section 35-11-112(c)(ii) authorizes the Council to order that any permit be modified as drafted by DEQ.

The Council having considered the parties' Joint Stipulation, including Attachment "A" thereto, and statements at the pre-hearing conference on August 29, 2007,

IT IS ORDERED that:

1. The parties' Joint Stipulation, including Attachment "A" thereto (Draft

WY0048917 Modification), is hereby approved and is binding upon the parties, their successors and assigns;

2. The contested Renewal of WYPDES Permit No. WY0048917 is hereby further modified and superseded as specifically set forth in Attachment "A";

Clabaugh's pending Petition for Review of the contested Renewal of WYPDES
Permit No. WY0048917 is hereby dismissed; and

4. Each party shall bear its own costs and attorney fees through the entry of this Order.

DATED this 1 day of November, 2008.

Dennis Boal, Chairman Environmental Quality Council 122 W. 25th, Rm. 1714 Herschler Bldg., Cheyenne, WY 82002 PHONE: 307-777-7170 FAX: 307-777-6134

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Kim Waring, certify that at Cheyenne, Wyoming, on the 9th day of December, 2008, I served a copy of the foregoing **ORDER** by electronic mail to the following;

Tom C. Toner Yonkee & Toner, LLP ttoner@yonkeetoner.com

John C. Martin Duane A. Siler Jeffrey A.Wertkin Patton Boggs, LLP jwertkin@pattonboggs.com

John Burbridge Office of Attorney General Jburb1@state.wy.us

John Corra Director, DEQ jcorra@state.wy.us Brent R. Kunz Hathaway & Kunz, P.C. brent@hkwyolaw.com

John Wagner, Administrator WDEQ jwagne@state.wy.us

Kim Waring, Executive Assistant Environmental Quality Council 122 W. 25th, Rm. 1714 Herschler Bldg. Cheyenne, WY 82002 Phone: 307-777-7170 FAX: 307-777-6134